Nicholas Viest Chair

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022-1106 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com - Website info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

The City of New York
Manhattan Community Board 8
CUNY-MSK Task Force
Wednesday, April 10, 2013
Memorial Sloan Kettering
430 East 67<sup>th</sup> Street
Auditorium
6:30PM

CB8 Members present – Elizabeth Ashby, Molly Blayney, Matt Bondy, Barbara Chocky, Susan Evans, Scott Falk, Ed Hartzog, David Helpern, Rita Popper, Peggy Price David Rosenstein, Barbara Rudder, Barry Schneider, Judy Schneider, Teri Slater, Marco Tamayo, Nick Viest, Elaine Walsh, Hedi White

6:40p Nick Viest called meeting to order

The meeting began with the representatives, Shelly Friedman, Todd Schliemann, and Ann Locke making a short presentation of the project, the ULURP actions and Zoning Text Amendment proposed by CUNY MSK.

A public session followed where Gari Smith-Alexiades, a resident showed slides of her building and the immediate area impacted by the project. She expressed strong concerns that the project would significantly degrade her quality of life with regard to open space, parking, congestion and the light and space she now enjoys in her home and neighborhood.

There was an extensive public session where members of the public were allowed 2 minutes to discuss their views on this project. Residents spoke about the Zoning Text Amendment being proposed which would grant the applicant 2 FAR in exchange for a contribution to the 197 A project – Andrew Haswell Green Park. Some residents spoke in favor of the park and other residents expressed significant concern about the traffic, construction, congestion and quality of life impacts on their neighborhood as a result of the project.

The Zoning Text Amendment was discussed in detail by the committee. The applicant did not cite a specific dollar amount for the contribution but stated that the money would go toward Phase 2 of the project. The project is currently underfunded by the city. The applicant stated that with this funding the project would be able to be finished using a combination of city and private funds given by MSK. The Parks Department would have the final say on the disposition of the funds.

This site was picked through discussions of the Parks Department and the applicant. The applicant stated that the site was selected because it represents the most significant parks related project in the area. The Community Board was not included in these discussions. The Community Board was notified of the decision to select Andrew Haswell Green Park during a previous Task Force meeting.

Members of the Community Board discussed their views on the Zoning Text Amendment. Those opposed to the text amendment were concerned about the precedent created by approving this Text Amendment, the open ended nature of the Amendment, that the proposed park is not in close proximity to the project and that the burden is greatest on those living near the project without any real benefits. Members opposed also expressed concerns of giving additional bulk to an already large building project and in general the encroachment of this project on a residential area.

Members in favor spoke about the advantages of having a park in the proposed area and that it would benefit everyone especially residents near Andrew Haswell Green Park. Members also stated that this area is in significant need of park space and that the funding would help to build this park. They also stated that the 197 A project has been supported by the Board. Members in favor also stated that other communities have similar arrangements and that while the project is large it is smaller than other institutional projects that have been recently approved by the board.

The Task Force passed the following resolution to <u>disapprove</u> the Zoning Text Amendment by a vote of 12 in favor, 6 opposed, and 1 abstention.

WHEREAS the City University of New York and Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center are planning to erect very large buildings in a heavily residential area on the east end of a block bounded by York Avenue, the FDR Drive and East 73 and 74th Streets: and WHEREAS Community Board 8, Manhattan, through its CUNY-MSK Task Force, has repeatedly urged CUNY-MSK officials to provide ample public open space on or near this planned building project to accommodate the needs of the local community affected by CUNY-MSK's large and intrusive project; and

WHEREAS, instead of acceding to the Community Board's request for public open space at or near the CUNY-MSK project, CUNY-MSK has inexplicably proposed a zoning text amendment that would allow it to provide money for the further development of Andrew Haswell Green Park, which is a sizable distance from the planned CUNY-MSK project; and WHEREAS the proposed zoning text amendment itself sets up a dangerous precedent because it would allow all developers to have, as of right, the ability to increase their floor area ratio by 20% above the amount allowed by current zoning provisions as long as they abide by the terms of this ill-defined text amendment; and

WHEREAS this proposed financial allocation, via the Parks Dept., to Andrew Haswell Green Park, violates the procedures of CB8M and sets a precarious precedent by circumventing the Community Board's CUNY-MSK Task Force and its Parks Committee—two committees that should have been consulted before CUNY-MSK project developers selected a site for funding public open space; and

**WHEREAS** CB8M already has passed a resolution calling for new construction projects in its district to include public open space as part of the project's design; therefore,

**BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 8, Manhattan, opposes the proposed text amendment included as part of the CUNY-MSK project.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that Community Board 8, Manhattan, reiterates its strong desire to have the CUNY-MSK project include public open space at or adjacent to its proposed construction project.

(12 In Favor)-Barbara Rudder, Barbara Chocky, Molly Blayney, Elizabeth Ashby, Ed Hartzog, Marco Tamayo, Elaine Walsh, David Rosenstein, Rita Popper, Susan Evans, Teri Slater, and Peggy Price

(6 Opposed)-David Helpern, Scott Falk, Barry Schneider, Judy Schneider, Matt Bondy, and Hedi White

(1 Abstention)-Nick Viest

The Chair adjourned the meeting at 8:45p

The City of New York
Manhattan Community Board 8
CUNY MSK Task Force
Ramaz School
125 East 85<sup>th</sup> Street (Park-Lex)
Auditorium
Wednesday April 30, 2013
6:30PM

CB8 Members present – Elizabeth Ashby, Molly Blayney, Barbara Chocky, Susan Evans, Ed Hartzog, David Helpern, Rita Popper, Peggy Price, David Rosenstein, Barbara Rudder, Barry Schneider, Judy Schneider, Teri Slater, Marco Tamayo, Nick Viest, Elaine Walsh, Hedi White

6:40p Nick Viest called meeting to order.

## **ZONING MAP CHANGE FROM M3-2 TO C1-9**

The Task Force passed the following resolution to <u>disapprove</u> the Zoning map change by a vote of 11 in favor, 4 opposed, 1 abstention, and 1 no vote for cause.

**WHEREAS** the Applicants have requested a zoning map change from M3-2 to C1-9, and **WHEREAS** the site is currently zoned for low-scale, low density, and low-traffic development, and

**WHEREAS** the proposal is to change the zoning to permit high-scale, high density, and high-traffic development, and

**WHEREAS** the character of the surrounding neighborhood features low-scale, low density, and low-traffic development, and

**WHEREAS** all of the side streets east of York Avenue and north of 72<sup>nd</sup> Street – with the exception of the few remaining manufacturing sites and one lot on 76<sup>th</sup> Street - have been rezoned to R8-B, and

WHEREAS this low-rise residential zoning reflects the character of the surrounding neighborhood, and

WHEREAS the site is on a narrow street, which is a cul de sac, and

WHEREAS the area is already suffering from excess traffic density, and

**WHEREAS** traffic will be increased and the congestion problems exacerbated when the Hospital for Special Surgery building is completed, and

WHEREAS any zoning change at this site should be to R8-B, and

**WHEREAS** the proposed zoning map change from M3-2 to C1-9 would cause serious damage to the character of the surrounding community and exacerbate the current traffic problems, and

**WHEREAS** the Applicant does not wish to utilize C1-9 zoning and seeks waivers of all its provisions, and

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 8, Manhattan, recommends **disapproval** of the proposed zoning map change.

(11 In Favor)-Barbara Rudder, Molly Blayney, Elizabeth Ashby, Ed Hartzog, Marco Tamayo, Elaine Walsh, David Rosenstein, Rita Popper, Susan Evans, Teri Slater, and Peggy Price

- (4 Opposed)-David Helpern, Barry Schneider, Judy Schneider, and Hedi White
- (1 Abstention)-Nick Viest
- (1 No Vote for Cause)-Rebecca Seawright

## **DISPOSITION OF PROJECT SITE**

The Task Force passed the following resolution to <u>disapprove</u> the proposed disposition of the project site by a vote of 11 in favor, 4 opposed, 1 abstention, and 1 no vote for cause.

**WHEREAS** the proposal involves the disposition of public property, the disposition of public funds, and the issuance of Dormitory Authority bonds, and

**WHEREAS** the public has not been provided with adequate information regarding the above dispositions, and

WHEREAS the proposed development would create a large and detrimental impact on the surrounding community, and

**WHEREAS** the Draft Environmental Impact Statement fails to recognize and address the project's adverse impacts, and

**WHEREAS** this project requires thorough re-examination before any disposition of the site could responsibly be considered;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 8, Manhattan, recommends **disapproval** of the proposed disposition of the project site.

- (11 In Favor)-Barbara Rudder, Molly Blayney, Elizabeth Ashby, Ed Hartzog, Marco Tamayo, Elaine Walsh, David Rosenstein, Rita Popper, Susan Evans, Teri Slater, and Peggy Price
- (4 Opposed)-David Helpern, Barry Schneider, Judy Schneider, and Hedi White
- (1 Abstention)-Nick Viest
- (1 No Vote for Cause)-Rebecca Seawright

## LARGE SCALE GENERAL DEVELOPMENT

The Task Force passed the following resolution to <u>disapprove</u> the proposal to develop the site as a Large Scale General Development by a vote of 11 in favor, 4 opposed, 1 abstention, and 1 no vote for cause.

**WHEREAS** the applicants seek to develop the site as a Large Scale General Development, and

WHEREAS the site in question has two different owners, and

WHEREAS the proposal calls for two different buildings, and

**WHEREAS** the proposed Large Scale General Development enables an MSK building that is even less respectful of the neighborhood's scale and character than a C1-9 building;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 8, Manhattan, recommends **disapproval** of the proposal to develop the site as a Large Scale General Development.

- (11 In Favor)-Barbara Rudder, Molly Blayney, Elizabeth Ashby, Ed Hartzog, Marco Tamayo, Elaine Walsh, David Rosenstein, Rita Popper, Susan Evans, Teri Slater, and Peggy Price
- (4 Opposed)-David Helpern, Barry Schneider, Judy Schneider, and Hedi White
- (1 Abstention)-Nick Viest
- (1 No Vote for Cause)-Rebecca Seawright

## **WAIVERS**

The Task Force passed the following resolution to <u>disapprove</u> the waivers by a vote of 11 in favor, 4 opposed, 1 abstention, and 1 no vote for cause.

**WHEREAS** Community Board 8-M recommends disapproval of the proposal to change the site's zoning from M3-2 to C1-9, and

**WHEREAS** waiving the maximum floor area regulations would increase the damage to the community of this zoning change, and

WHEREAS waiving the rear yard equivalent regulations would increase the damage to the community of this zoning change, and

**WHEREAS** waiving the minimum side yard requirements would increase the damage to the community of this zoning change, and

**WHEREAS** waiving the height and setback regulations would increase the damage to the community of this zoning change, and

**WHEREAS** the proposed buildings would cast significant shadows over local parks, residents, and amenities;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Community Board 8, Manhattan, recommends disapproval of the proposed waiver of the floor area regulations, of the proposed waiver of the rear yard equivalent regulations, of the proposed waiver of the minimum required side yard regulations, and of the proposed waiver of the height and setback regulations..

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Community Board 8, Manhattan, recommends disapproval of the proposed waiver of the floor area regulations, and BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Community Board 8, Manhattan, recommends disapproval of the proposed waiver of the rear yard equivalent regulations, and BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Community Board 8, Manhattan, recommends disapproval of the proposed waiver of the minimum required side yard regulations, and BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Community Board 8, Manhattan, recommends disapproval of the proposed waiver of the height and setback regulations.

- (11 In Favor)-Barbara Rudder, Molly Blayney, Elizabeth Ashby, Ed Hartzog, Marco Tamayo, Elaine Walsh, David Rosenstein, Rita Popper, Susan Evans, Teri Slater, and Peggy Price
- (4 Opposed)-David Helpern, Barry Schneider, Judy Schneider, and Hedi White
- (1 Abstention)-Nick Viest
- (1 No Vote for Cause)-Rebecca Seawright

The Chair adjourned the meeting at?