Nicholas Viest Chairman

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com - Website info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

# The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

# <u>Landmarks Committee, March 19, 2012 – 6:30PM</u> The Chapin School, 100 East End Avenue, Gordon Room

**Present:** Jane Parshall, Teri Slater, Elizabeth Ashby, Marco Tamayo, Susan Evans, Michele Birnbaum, David Liston, Kenneth Austin, David Helpern, Christina Davis

1. **4 East 75<sup>th</sup> Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District –** *Ms. Sara Lopergolo, Architect & Oliver Link, Architect* – A neo-French Renaissance style townhouse designed by Trowbridge, Colt and Livingston Architects and built in 1895-96. Application is to alter the rear facade.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to, among other changes, (1) replace the current windows on the rear facade with new windows, framed in dark wood, that are more uniform in style and size; (2) create a setback on the fourth (top) floor, using blackened steel for railings and sliding glass doors; (3) install Juliet balconies, including a long balcony on the main level, and smaller balconies on the upper floors; and (4) cut out concrete in-full in the rear yard, replacing it with a new garden level. WHEREAS the proposed changes would result in too much glazing, too contemporary a rear facade, and the proposed design lacks sufficient character for a building with this history. THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application be disapproved as presented.

**VOTE:** 8 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Birnbaum, Evans, Liston, Parshall, Slater, and Tamayo) 2 against (Davis, Helpern)

2. **28 East 70th Street, 15th Floor (at Madison Avenue) – Upper East Side Historic District** – *Mr. Angelo Costa, Architect* – A neo Gothic-style apartment hotel built in 1926-27 and designed by Emory Roth. Application is to enlarge a window opening.

WHEREAS the applicant failed to appear.

**THREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT** the application be **disapproved** and that the applicant present at a future time.

**VOTE:** 10 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

3. 1067-1071 Lexington Avenue aka 170 East 76th Street [Saint Jean Baptiste Church] – INDIVIUAL LANDMARK - *Michael F. Doyle, FAIA*. Application is to replace limestone columns at the bell tower.

**WHEREAS** 1067-1071 Lexington Avenue is an Italian Renaissance style church, designed by Nicholas Sirracino and built in 1910.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to replace the limestone columns on two bell towers with replica columns made of carbon-fiber-reinforced plastic ("CFRP") due to cracks in the existing limestone. **WHEREAS** the use of CFRP would diminish the architectural grandeur of this individual landmark on the national register landmarks, and the Committee is not persuaded that every possible alternative to such material has been thoroughly explored.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **disapproved** as presented.

**VOTE**: 10 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

4. **968 Lexington Avenue (between 70th and 71st Streets) – Upper East Side Historic District** - *Pei-Yu Lin, Project Manager* - An Italianate style rowhouse built in 1871-72 and altered in 1928. Application is to install a bracket sign.

**WHEREAS** the store already has an attractive awning with its name displayed; **WHEREAS** the sign would not be placed in front of the store but above the awning on the second floor.

WHEREAS the store has high visibility because of the foot traffic on Lexington Avenue. WHEREAS the sign is not appropriate in the historic district. THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT that the sign be **disapproved**.

**VOTE:** 9 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater) 1 abstention (Tamayo)

5. **31 East 63rd Street (between Madison and Park Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District** - *Mr. Jose Ramirez, Architect.* Application for a rearyard addition and restorations of the front and rear façade.

**WHEREAS** 31 East 63<sup>rd</sup> Street is a neo-Grec style house constructed in 1877-78 by Charles Baxter and altered in 1938 by Treanor & Fatio.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to construct a rearyard addition and to restore the front and rear facade.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to, among other steps, construct a rearyard addition that would overlap a non-conforming existing 2-story extension by adding 3 stories over the existing 2 stories; restore the front and rear facade with beige limestone; install windows with wood frames painted black in the front of the building; install windows with metal frames painted black in the rear of the building, said windows in the rear to have a fenestration that would be different from that of the windows that would be replaced in the rear and different from that of the windows in the front of the building; and add a front entry portico similar to that found on an adjacent building.

**WHEREAS** the Committee decided to consider this application in two parts: (1) The Rearyard Addition and Rear Facade and (2) The Front Facade.

# Part 1: The Rearyard Addition and Rear Facade

**WHEREAS** the proposed rearyard addition and rear facade would have excessive glazing and would result in a style and design not in character with the rest of the building. **THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **disapproved** as presented.

**VOTE:** 6 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Evans, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo), 4 against (Austin, Davis, Helpern, Liston)

#### Part 2: The Front Facade

**WHEREAS** the proposed front facade is consistent with the character of the building and with the character of adjacent buildings.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

**VOTE:** 10 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

6. **149 E. 73rd Street aka 1019-1029 Lexington Avenue aka 145-151 East 73rd Street – Upper East Side Historic District Extension** *- Panorama Windows, Ltd. –* A Renaissance Revival style apartment building designed by J.E.R. Carpenter and built in 1924. Application to replace windows.

**WHEREAS** the applicant failed to appear.

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT** the application be **disapproved** and that the applicant present at a future time.

**VOTE:** 10 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

 12 East 79th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) [School of Practical Philosophy] – Metropolitan Museum Historic District – Brian Connolly, Principal – A neo-Georgian townhouse designed by Little & Browne and built in 1901-03. Application for new signage panels.

WHEREAS the two proposed sign boxes are within the boundaries of the railing.
WHEREAS the sign boxes are restrained and balanced in their design and placement on the railing.
WHEREAS the sign boxes are attached to the railing with clips and are not welded.
WHEREAS the sign boxes are not illuminated;
THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application be approved as presented.

**VOTE:** 8 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Birnbaum, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Slater Tamayo), 1 against (Parshall), 1 abstention (Davis)

# 8. 1511 Third Avenue (1511-1515 Third Avenue aka 201-203 East 85th Street (Yorkville Bank Building).

The Committee is aware that a proposal has been made to landmark the above-referenced building, an Italian Renaissance Revival structure that Robert Maynicke built in 1905 and which was altered in 1923-24. Several members of the Committee expressed support for landmarking the building. No members expressed opposition to landmarking the building. Several members said they were not familiar with the building and, noting that no one had appeared at the meeting to support or oppose or otherwise speak to the application, they expressed the desire for further information concerning the architectural significance of same. At the conclusion of extensive discussion, the consensus of the Committee was that the Board Chair and the Landmarks Committee Co-Chairs should together send a letter to the Landmarks Preservation Commission, expressing the above and requesting that the applications, as well as perhaps a representative of the Landmarks Preservation Commission, might appear before the Committee to discuss the merits of designation as relates to this building.

# David Helpern and David Liston, Co-Chairs