James G. Clynes Chair

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022-1106 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com - Website info@cb8m.com E-Mail

The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8 Landmarks Committee, Monday, Monday, February 9, 2015–6:30PM Rockefeller University, 1230 York Avenue, Weiss Building, Rm. 305

Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Michele Birnbaum, Sarah Chu, Susan Evans, David Helpern, David Liston, Jane Parshall, Marco Tamayo

1. **5 East 88th Street (Fifth and Madison)-Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District**-*Abir Ahmad, Architect*- Beaux-Arts style townhouse designed by Turner and Kilian and completed in 1902-03. Application is to repair and replace three exterior windows as well as an exterior railing on a third floor unit.

WHEREAS 5 East 88th Street is a Beaux-Arts style townhouse designed by Turner and Kilian and completed in 1902-03.

WHEREAS 5 East 88th Street is adjacent to the Guggenheim Museum;

WHEREAS above the ground level, there is a bowed, three-story midsection;

WHEREAS at the 3rd floor the windows are in poor condition; the applicant proposes to replace them with in-kind custom mahogany windows as well as restore the exiting exterior railing;

WHEREAS sometime during the 1940s, stained glass windows, visible in tax photos, were installed at the 3rd floor.

WHEREAS the stained glass windows were subsequently replaced with clear glazing;

WHEREAS although the stained glass windows were not part of the original historic fabric at 5 East 88th Street, the Landmarks Preservation Commission wanted to include this information as part of the record for this application;

WHEREAS the application to replace the windows and restore the railing is contextual and appropriate within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application be approved as presented.

VOTE: 6 in favor (Birnbaum, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Chu)

2. **151 East 71**st **Street** (**Lexington and Third**)-**Upper East Side Historic District**-*Manuel Castedeo, Architect*-Italianate style residence designed by unknown and completed in 1870. Application to legalize second floor window (front façade) and retail store awning.

This application is divided into two parts:

Part 1: Second Floor Windows

WHEREAS the windows are located in the central masonry opening on the second floor of the white brick frontal addition to the original brownstone building;

WHEREAS the designation for 15 east 71st Street included steel windows with fixed glass in the center and casement windows with transoms above on each side of the fixed central window;

WHEREAS the steel windows were replaced with a pair of one-over-one, double hung, aluminum windows with an aluminum post in the center;

WHEREAS the aluminum windows were installed without Landmarks Preservation Commission approval;

WHEREAS the steel windows were visually light and elegant in contrast to the aluminum windows which are visually dark and heavy due to the thickness and color of the aluminum post, frames, and sashes;

WHEREAS the steel windows were related to the steel railing with vertical balusters directly above on the third floor balcony;

WHEREAS the aluminum windows and the steel railing are different in material and style;

WHEREAS the aluminum windows replaced steel windows that were more appropriate to the overall composition of the addition:

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved.

Vote: 6 in favor (Birnbaum, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)

1 abstention (Ashby)

Part 2: Awning

WHEREAS the building has a storefront that is framed with brick masonry piers;

WHEREAS the existing awning spans across the storefront and the piers;

WHEREAS the awning proposed to replace the existing awning will be set between the piers and will be framed by the piers;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the proposed awning is approved as presented.

Vote: 7 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)

3. New Business- St. Thomas More Church Complex, 65 East 89th Street (Carnegie Hill Neighbors/Mary Dierickx): Applicant is seeking designation for the church complex as an individual landmark by the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

WHEREAS St. Thomas More Church was designed in the Gothic Revival Style by the highly regarded architectural firm, Hubert & Pirsson.

WHEREAS Hubert & Pirsson were active during New York City's "Gilded Age" (1870s to about 1900) and produced many of the city's finest buildings, including hotels, churches, and residences. Individual landmarks include the Chelsea Hotel and (in Carnegie Hill), 6 Queen Anne style row houses at 146-156 East 89th Street. WHEREAS the church was originally built as the Church of the Beloved Disciple as a house of worship for

residents of St. Luke's Home for Indigent Christian Females

WHEREAS the four-building complex was built in stages between 1870 and 1892.

WHEREAS the church, including its prominent signature bell tower (said to be modeled on Tour de St Jacques in Paris) is an outstanding example of Gothic Revival ecclesiastical architecture and the whole group is largely intact as originally built.

WHEREAS St. Thomas More Church is the second oldest surviving church in the Upper East side and is the oldest building in the Carnegie Hill community west of Park Avenue.

WHEREAS the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8M urges the Landmarks Preservation Commission to act without delay in calendaring the Carnegie Hill Neighbors Request for Evaluation ("RFE") for this site.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8M enthusiastically supports the Carnegie Hill Neighbors Request for Evaluation for St. Thomas More Church.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Tamayo, Chu)

David Helpern and Jane Parshall - Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee