

Nicholas Viest
Chairman

Latha Thompson
District Manager



505 Park Avenue
Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com - Website
info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

The City of New York
Manhattan Community Board 8

Landmarks Committee, February 11, 2013 – 6:30PM

Marymount Manhattan College, 221 East 71st Street, 2nd Floor, Regina Peruggi Room

Present: David Helpern, David Liston, Jane Parshall, Teri Slater, Marco Tamayo, Elizabeth Ashby, Susan Evans

Excused Absence: Christina Davis, Michelle Birnbaum, Kenneth Austin,

1. **815 Fifth Avenue (between 62nd and 63rd Streets) – Upper East Side Historic District - *T.P. Greer Architects, LLC*** – An Italianate style residence designed by Samuel A. Warner in 1870-71 and altered by Murgatroyd & Ogden in 1923. Application is to reconstruct the entire building façade.

WHEREAS the existing, 25 foot wide, five story brownstone with be expanded vertically into a 14 story building,

WHEREAS the proposed enlargement of the existing building will demolish the remaining elements of the original façade of the oldest building on Fifth Avenue;

WHEREAS the scale of the block, with its variegated character, provides a relief from the typical cornice line blocks on Fifth Avenue;

WHEREAS the modern design, with large windows in a limestone grid, is not compatible with the character of the buildings on the block; and

WHEREAS the rear glass curtain wall is totally out of context with its surroundings;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is **disapproved**.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, and Tamayo)

2. **150 East 73rd Street aka 1009-1017 Lexington Avenue - Upper East Side Historic District Extension - *Panorama Windows, Ltd.*** – A Colonial Revival style apartment building designed by Cross & Cross and built in 1922-23. Application is to replace windows.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace windows on the East, West, North, and South facades pursuant to a Master Plan;

WHEREAS of the several dozen windows on each facade, only seven windows have their original eight-over-eight fenestration and those seven original windows are all located on the rear facade of the building;

WHEREAS all of the other windows for the building have been replaced with one-over-one windows;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes a Master Plan intended to standardize one-over-one windows on all facades of the building and to uniformly replicate original panning detail and pre-mold carvings;

WHEREAS the original fenestration of eight-over-eight was an important feature in the character of this landmark building and the proposed one-over-one windows are at odds with original design and are not appropriate for a building of this character;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the proposed Master Plan is **disapproved**.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, and Tamayo)

3. **789 Madison Avenue (at 67th Street) – Upper East Side Historic District** - *Rebecca Vulic and Philip Rosenzweig, Architects* – An Italianate/neo-Grec style residence designed by F.S. Barus in 1871 and altered by Albro & Lindeberg in 1909 with some neo-classical elements. Application is to modify the storefront.

WHEREAS the existing surround of the storefront will remain intact;

WHEREAS the existing infill for the storefront will be replaced with an elegant design; and

WHEREAS the proposed design fits with the character of the storefronts on Madison Avenue;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is **approved**.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, and Tamayo)

4. **20 East 64th Street (between Fifth Avenue and Madison Avenue) - Upper East Side Historic District** - *David H. Abelow, Architect* - A Neo-French Renaissance residence designed by D. & J. Jardine and built in 1878-79 and altered by Harry Allan Jacobs in 1920-21. Application is to alter rear façade, create a new sub-cellar level, replace windows, and construct new bulkhead at roof.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to alter the rear facade, create a new sub-cellar level in the rear of the building, replace windows in the rear of the building, and construct two new bulkheads on the roof;

WHEREAS the Landmarks Committee wishes to vote separately as to the proposed fenestration for the first and second floor windows of the rear facade (Part 1) and to take together the remaining items (Part 2).

Part 1 (the proposed fenestration for the first and second floor windows of the rear facade).

WHEREAS, while the proposed fenestration to the third, fourth, and fifth windows of the rear façade are better-ordered and more characteristic for the building than the proposed first and second floor windows of the rear facade, the committee appreciates that the proposed first and second floor windows of the rear facade are intended to be large enough to enable light to penetrate from, and into, a rearyard that is so small, it is almost non-existent;

WHEREAS the proposed first and second floor windows are not contrary to the overall character of the building;

WHEREAS the proposed first and second floor windows are made of steel, the same as the proposed windows on the third, fourth, and fifth floors;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the proposed fenestration for the first and second floor windows of the rear facade is approved.

VOTE: 5 in favor (Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo), 2 against (Ashby, Evans)

Part 2 (the remaining items).

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to remove from the roof existing HVAC equipment and to replace the existing elevator and staircase bulkhead with a new elevator and staircase bulkhead;

WHEREAS with regard to the rear of the building at ground level, the applicant proposes to remove the existing foundation walls to accommodate a new cellar level extension and new sub-cellar level construction below; remove the existing wood decking assembly at the exterior rear yard; and remove a portion of the existing ground level rear facade to accommodate a new steel and glass assembly with two doors, one opening into the rear yard and the other opening into the side yard;

WHEREAS the proposed elevator bulkhead and staircase bulkhead will be in the same approximate location on the roof as the existing elevator and staircase bulkhead and will be minimally visible from the public way;

WHEREAS the proposed alterations to the windows on the third, fourth, and fifth floors will replace, in a manner consistent with the overall character of the building, what is presently a hodge-podge of different window styles on the rear façade;

WHEREAS the above-mentioned proposed changes, individually and collectively, are not inconsistent with the character of the building;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the above-mentioned proposed changes are approved.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

5. **737 Park Avenue (between 71st and 72nd Streets) - Upper East Side Historic District** - *Malay Shah, Architect and Michael F. Doyle, Architect* - A Classicizing Art-Deco style apartment building built in 1940 and designed by Sylvan Bien. Application is to regroup and create new window openings on 17-PH floors.

WHEREAS the Master Plan for windows approved by Landmarks will be adjusted to improve the Plan; whereas 4 doors and 14 windows out of approximately 1,200 windows and doors will have their locations adjusted;

WHEREAS these adjustments take place on the 17th, 19th, and penthouse floors;

WHEREAS many of these openings are not visible from the ground;

WHEREAS these adjustments either restore a window previously closed up, align windows and doors with those below, and/or create symmetrical relationships on their respective floors and with windows on the typical floors; and

WHEREAS the adjustments are contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is **approved**.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, and Tamayo)

David Helpern and David Liston, Co-Chairs