

Valerie S. Mason  
Chair

Will Brightbill  
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620  
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106  
(212) 758-4340  
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
[www.cb8m.com](http://www.cb8m.com) – Website  
[info@cb8m.com](mailto:info@cb8m.com) – E-Mail

**The City of New York  
Community Board 8 Manhattan  
Landmarks Committee  
Monday, February 10, 2025 – 6:30 PM  
*This meeting was conducted via Zoom.***

**PLEASE NOTE:** When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, February 19, 2025**. They may testify for up to two minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

**MINUTES:**

**Board Members Present:** Elizabeth Ashby, Gayle Barom, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, David Helpen, John McClement, Jane Parshall, Abraham Salcedo, and Marco Tamayo.

**Approximate Number of Public Attendees:** 24

**Resolutions for Approval:**

- Item 1:** 1014 Fifth Avenue
- Item 2:** 156 East 71<sup>st</sup> Street
- Item 3:** 54 East 66<sup>th</sup> Street
- Item 4:** 640 Park Avenue

**Item 1: 1014 Fifth Avenue (Metropolitan Museum Historic District)** – *KARO Architects LLP* – A Beaux-Arts town house designed by Welch, Smith, & Provot and constructed in 1906-1907, with renovation and extension by Trowbridge & Livingston in 1926. Post Approval Amendment application is for the modification of the proposed extension walls ('wing walls') on the new fifth floor roof terrace in the rear of the building to allow for more light and air and to improve the views for the neighbors.

**WHEREAS** 1014 Fifth Avenue is a Beaux Arts townhouse whose contemporary design for the rear of the building has been submitted for a Post Approval Amendment application; and

**WHEREAS** the approved roof terrace at the rear of the building is designed with wing walls and a dense pergola roof; and

**WHEREAS** the terrace is 22'-6" wide by 29'-0" long; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant seeks to frame the opening to the east to create a surround with a header; and

**WHEREAS** the reduced opening will be 15'-6" wide, similar in character to the existing punched openings; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant will introduce punched 6'-10" wide openings in the north and south walls; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant will replace the existing pergola roof with a less dense pergola; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant will create an outdoor room protected from the weather; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant will create framed views more in character with the existing openings in the north, south, and east elevations; and

**WHEREAS** the modifications to the existing fabric maintain the architectural vocabulary of the approved alteration; and

**WHEREAS** the Post Approval Amendment is contextual and appropriate within the historic district;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 10-0-0-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Helpern, McClement, Parshall, Salcedo, Tamayo)

**Item 2: 156 East 71st Street (Upper East Side Historic District)** – *Daniel Kaplan* – An Italianate style building designed by W. O’Gorman and constructed in 1871. Application is for interior renovation, rooftop addition, small rear addition with a terrace above, renovation of front areaway, and the addition of stairs to the sidewalk.

**WHEREAS** 156 East 71st Street is a house located on the south side of East 71st Street on a block with tall buildings on Lexington and Third Avenues and four and five-story rowhouses between; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to largely restore the street façade, which is brownstone-colored stucco with brownstone window and door trim; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant further proposes to modify the existing areaway at the street side of the building to improve the entry sequence while remaining within the property line; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant further proposes to build a rooftop addition, replace all windows with aluminum-clad wood units, replace exterior light fixtures, and modify the rear façade; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant’s proposal for the rooftop addition will not be visible from any point in the public way and will feature a steel window and door system that will measure 14’-3” in width and will be 7’-2” tall; and

**WHEREAS** the rooftop addition will be 9’-9” tall with a stair bulkhead above for roof access, set back from the street wall 6’-11”, and set back 3’-0” from the existing rear facade; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to enlarge the ground (basement) floor by 7’-5”; and

**WHEREAS** the windows openings at the rear façade of the first floor of the building will be combined and the resulting opening will be glazed with a steel window/door combination measuring 14’-0” in width and approx. 9’-0” in height; and

**WHEREAS** some members of the Committee felt that the rooftop addition was too large and that the windows in the rear would contribute to light pollution in the “donut” of the block, these concerns were not felt to be a disqualifying;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 10-0-0-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Helpern, McClement, Parshall, Salcedo, Tamayo)

**Item 3: 54 East 66th Street (Upper East Side Historic District)** – *Stephen Conte, StudiosC Architecture* – A Neo-Grec style building designed by J.H. Valentine and constructed in 1877-78. Application is for the conversion of a multifamily townhouse to a single townhouse, stairs and elevator bulkhead addition at the roof, addition to existing extension at the rear yard, new wall and window openings at the rear yard, and leveling of the roof.

**WHEREAS** the applicant is converting this 20-foot-wide multifamily townhouse to a single-family townhouse; and

**WHEREAS** the Neo-Grec front façade will remain unchanged; and

**WHEREAS** the façade on the rear of the building will be removed; and

**WHEREAS** the existing rear extension on 54 East 66th Street will be raised to match the extension on 56 East 66th Street; and

**WHEREAS** the wall will be rebuilt to match the height of the fourth floor of 56 East 66th Street; and

**WHEREAS** a new brick façade will be built on 54 East 66th Street to match brick façade on 56 East 66th Street; and

**WHEREAS** new windows will be installed at 54 East 66th Street to match the windows at 56 East 66th Street; and

**WHEREAS** the cornice and top line of windows at 54 East 66th Street will be aligned with the cornice and top line of windows at 56 East 66th Street; and

**WHEREAS** the color of the new brick at 54 East 66th Street will match the color of the brick at 56 East 66th Street to achieve continuity; and

**WHEREAS** the fourth floor, which remains setback, will have brick to match the brick below; and

**WHEREAS** the windows on the fourth floor will be replaced with a center door and windows either side; and

**WHEREAS** the fourth floor will have a sloped upper roof with a batten-seam aluminum roof system; and

**WHEREAS** the new stair and elevator bulkhead will be made of brick to match the new brick of the rear façade; and

**WHEREAS** the new bulkhead will have a glass vestibule; and

**WHEREAS** the new brick will be red with light gray mortar; and

**WHEREAS** window mullions, copings, and rails at the rear setback at the top of the third floor and at the edge of the roof of the fourth floor will be brown coated aluminum; and

**WHEREAS** the sloped roof on the fourth floor will be brown coated aluminum; and

**WHEREAS** mechanical equipment on the rear roof will have wood screening; and

**WHEREAS** the bulkhead is not visible from directly across the street; and

**WHEREAS** the new “International Style” rear façade is not contextual and appropriate within the historic district;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **DISAPPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 6-5-0-0 (Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Parshall, Tamayo)

**Board Members Opposed:** (Ashby, Baron, Helpen, McClement, Salcedo)

**Item 4: 640 Park Avenue (Upper East Side Historic District)** – *Matthew Viederman Architect* – A Neo-Italian Renaissance style building designed by James E.R. Carpenter and constructed in 1914. Application is for a window replacement on the top floor.

**WHEREAS** 640 Park Avenue is a COOP apartment house located on the northwest corner of 66th Street and Park Avenue; and

**WHEREAS** each floor of 640 Park Avenue contains a single apartment; and

**WHEREAS** 640 Park Avenue has no Window Replacement Master Plan, and several different window types are presently installed in the building; and

**WHEREAS** the Consul General of Switzerland has occupied the 14th floor of 640 Park Avenue for many years; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes, as part of a general renovation to the 14th floor, to replace all the existing, obviously non-original aluminum double-hung windows with new metal-clad tilt-turn wood windows that will imitate the appearance of double-hung units; and

**WHEREAS** the proposed triple-glazed windows will have a fixed upper sash and operable lower sash and will be much more energy efficient than the existing windows; and

**WHEREAS** the fenestration is set back from the surface plane of the building; and

**WHEREAS** the “meeting rail” and side stiles of the windows will be larger (by approximately 50%) than the existing aluminum windows; and

**WHEREAS** several Committee members expressed concern that the wood members of the proposed windows were out of character with the building and that the tilt-turn operating mechanism was inappropriate although the apartment is some 150 feet above the street; and

**WHEREAS** the Committee urges 640 Park Avenue to adopt a window replacement plan, the absence of which contributed to the unease over introducing the proposed window type to the building;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **DISAPPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 5-4-0-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Parshall)

**Board Members Opposed:** (Chu, Cohn, McClement, Tamayo)

**Items 5&6: Old Business/New Business**

The meeting was capped off by a discussion on the Russell Page designed East 70th Street Garden at The Frick Collection. There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 8:38 PM.

**Anthony Cohn and David Helpern, Co-Chairs**