

Valerie S. Mason  
Chair

Will Brightbill  
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620  
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106  
(212) 758-4340  
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
www.cb8m.com – Website  
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York  
Community Board 8 Manhattan  
Landmarks Committee  
Monday, December 16, 2024 – 6:30 PM  
*This meeting was conducted via Zoom.***

**PLEASE NOTE:** When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, December 18, 2024**. They may testify for up to two minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

**MINUTES:**

**Board Members Present:** Elizabeth Ashby, Gayle Baron, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, Christina Davis (Public Member), David Helpern, John McClement, Jane Parshall, Abraham Salcedo, and Marco Tamayo.

**Approximate Number of Public Attendees:** 22

**Resolutions for Approval:**

**Item 1:** 1 East 78th Street

**Item 2:** 1312 Madison Avenue

**Item 3:** 694 & 696 Madison Avenue

**Item 4:** 41-43 East 70th Street

**Item 1: 1 East 78th Street (Metropolitan Museum Historic District)** – *Juan C. Matiz* – A French Neoclassical building designed by Horace Trumbauer and constructed in 1900-1912. Application is to provide ADA compliant access to the basement level.

**WHEREAS** 1 East 78<sup>th</sup> Street, The James B. Duke House, is now the home of the Institute of Fine Arts of New York University; and

**WHEREAS** the building must be prepared to receive people who have disabilities; and

**WHEREAS** the first floor is raised above sidewalk level; and

**WHEREAS** the building is surrounded by a 52” high stone wall that is interrupted by the central entrance stair; and

**WHEREAS** the architectural composition of the building precludes incorporating a ramp up to the first floor; and

**WHEREAS** there is an existing areaway at the eastern end of the building with an entrance to the building within the areaway; and

**WHEREAS** there is an ornamental gate within the stone wall providing access to the stair within the areaway; and

**WHEREAS** the areaway is 7’-11” wide; it can accommodate a 3’-8” wide stair and a 3’-8” wide ramp; and

**WHEREAS** the basement level is 5’6 ½” below sidewalk level; and

**WHEREAS** the distance is too short for a ramp to descend to basement level; and

**WHEREAS** a ramp will be constructed to a landing 1'-7 1/4" below sidewalk level; and

**WHEREAS** a lift will be constructed to connect the landing to the basement level 3'-11 1/4" below the landing; and

**WHEREAS** stairs from basement to cellar remain; and

**WHEREAS** the arrangement of stairs and ramp will enable egress from the cellar and basement to be maintained; and

**WHEREAS** original granite steps will be used where in good condition and new granite steps to match will be used where needed; and

**WHEREAS** the lift will be gray in color to match the granite; and

**WHEREAS** new railings will match the existing; and

**WHEREAS** the granite base and ornamental guard rail at the stair opening to subcellar will remain; and

**WHEREAS** most of the improvements will be hidden from view; and

**WHEREAS** there is no change to the exterior facade or wall; and

**WHEREAS** this project is appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 9-0-0-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Helpert, McClement, Parshall, Tamayo)

**Item 2: 1312 Madison Avenue (Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District)** – *Alta Indelman, Architect* – A Renaissance Revival building designed by George W. Spitzer and constructed in 1897. Application is to install one new awning and legalize one existing AC unit.

**WHEREAS** 1312 Madison Avenue is a retail space at the southwest corner of 93<sup>rd</sup> Street and Madison Avenue; and

**WHEREAS** this space has been used as a restaurant for some time and has an existing non-conforming awning and air conditioning units mounted beneath it; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to cure the violations by replacing the canopy, relocating one air conditioning unit and eliminating the other; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes a new canopy whose size and location conforms to LPC rules and conceals the air conditioning unit; and

**WHEREAS** the new canopy will extend eight feet from the building face with a one-foot-deep flap and open sides and bottom; and

**WHEREAS** some Committee members and a member of the public expressed concern over the projection from the building; and

**WHEREAS** the Committee recognized the difficulties connected with the new canopy: the anchoring location at the building aligns with other canopies on the block, and the minimum clearance from the AC unit dictates the angle and projection from the building; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant explained that there are no convenient alternate locations for the AC unit; and

**WHEREAS** the Committee appreciates the applicant's revising their previous application appearing before the Committee for a second time;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 9-2-1-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, McClement, Salcedo)

**Board Members Opposed:** (Parshall, Davis)

**Board Members Abstained:** (Tamayo)

**Item 3: 694 & 696 Madison Avenue (Upper East Side Historic District) – *Kenneth Park*** – A Neo-Grec building designed by J.H. Valentine and constructed in 1878-1879. Application is for rear yard additions and structural changes, storefront infill replacement, new signage along Madison Avenue, new awnings at the storefront and upper floor windows, and a façade restoration.

**WHEREAS** 694 & 696 Madison Avenue were built as part of a row of brownstone buildings in 1878-1879; and

**WHEREAS** the two-story storefronts were added in 1912, and the buildings were combined; and

**WHEREAS** each building was 20' wide and the combined buildings are 40' wide; and

**WHEREAS** the storefronts were changed over time; and

**WHEREAS** a new storefront will be built to replace the existing storefront; and

**WHEREAS** damage to the existing cornice and brick masonry will be repaired; and

**WHEREAS** the existing party wall will be removed; and

**WHEREAS** the removal of the party wall will not be apparent in that a brick pier will be retained in the new storefront design; and

**WHEREAS** the storefronts have had tripartite designs; and

**WHEREAS** the new storefront will have two partite components the width of each of the two original buildings; and

**WHEREAS** the two major materials in the new storefronts will be clear glazing and green tile; and

**WHEREAS** the tile appears to slide in and out of the glazing; and

**WHEREAS** each component on the ground floor will have a projected full height show window in the center, a recessed tile door to the upper floors between the show window and the outer wall, and a glass door to the store between the center pier and the show window; and

**WHEREAS** each component on the second floor will have glazing in line with the show window or doors below and green tile set behind the glazing; and

**WHEREAS** each component will have a gray stone portal and a gray stone spandrel; and

**WHEREAS** the logo sign will be applied to the spandrel with internally lit white letters; and

**WHEREAS** each component has walnut fins that function as mullions; and

**WHEREAS** each component has a brass frame and door base; and

**WHEREAS** the brick piers will be painted gray; and

**WHEREAS** each component will have a white retractable awning that will extend at the bottom a maximum of 1'-1 ¼"; and

**WHEREAS** each window on the upper floors will have a white retractable awning that will also project minimally from the window; and

**WHEREAS** there will be signs on the bottoms of the awnings; and

**WHEREAS** the letters on the sign on the spandrel will be 14” high and the letters on the window awnings will be 3” high; and

**WHEREAS** new LED linear recessed cove lighting will be set into the walnut portal/surround; and

**WHEREAS** there is a one-story extension built to the rear property line on the 696 portion of the building; and

**WHEREAS** this extension will be extended vertically through the fourth floor to approximate the height of the adjacent building; and

**WHEREAS** blind windows with lintels and sills to match existing windows will be set into the new masonry wall on the third and fourth floors; and

**WHEREAS** a new enclosure will be built to the rear property line on the 694 portion of the building to accommodate an elevator and a new egress stair; and

**WHEREAS** all visible areas of the new extensions will be red brick masonry; and

**WHEREAS** all mechanical equipment will be hidden on the roof; and

**WHEREAS** the two-story storefront is a contemporary version of the tripartite arrangements of prior storefronts; and

**WHEREAS** the design of the new storefront is appropriate for Madison Avenue retail; and

**WHEREAS** the upper stories on Madison Avenue will remain unchanged except for the addition of the awnings; and

**WHEREAS** this project is appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 9-1-2-0 (Baron, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Davis, Helpen, McClement, Parshall, Salcedo)

**Board Members Opposed:** (Birnbaum)

**Board Members Abstained:** (Ashby, Tamayo)

**Item 4: 41-43 East 70th Street (Upper East Side Historic District)** – *Peter Pennoyer Architects DPC* – A Regency Revival building designed by Mott B. Schmidt and constructed in 1928-1929. Application is for the restoration of and alterations to 43 East 70th Street front and rear facades, new windows & exterior doors, addition of a rooftop stair and elevator bulkheads, and connection to 41 East 70th Street through new openings in the party wall.

**WHEREAS** 41 East 70<sup>th</sup> Street and 43 East 70<sup>th</sup> Street are adjacent six-story residential buildings on the north side of 70th Street between Madison and Park Avenues, built in 1928 and designed by Eymar Embury and Mott Schmidt, respectively; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to combine the two buildings into a single-family residence and repair the exterior of 41 East 70<sup>th</sup> Street and to restore the exterior of 43 East 70<sup>th</sup> Street; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to recreate the original entry, replace limestone repairs with stone that matches better the original French limestone, replace the non-original windows with new wood windows to replicate the original construction, replace non-original railings with new railings that will replicate the original construction, repair the existing cornice, rebuild the failing roof dormers, and restore the Mansard roof to its original appearance; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant further proposes to remove the stucco covering the existing bluestone at the areaway, replacing the deteriorated bluestone; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to restore the face brick on the garden façade, replace the non-original fabric with materials conforming to the original design, add new wood windows, and convert three windows and one garden entrance to doors leading to a small rear terrace; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to reconfigure the sixth floor, add a roof terrace, and extend an egress stair and elevator to the roof; and

**WHEREAS** Mott Schmidt's biographer, Mark Alan Hewitt, described 43 East 70<sup>th</sup> Street as "probably the best of Mott Schmidt's later urban residences"; and

**WHEREAS** the Committee recognizes the outstanding effort and level of detail that the applicants have brought to this proposal;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 12-0-0-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Davis, Helpern, McClement, Parshall, Salcedo, Tamayo)

**Items 5&6: Old Business/New Business**

The meeting was capped off by a brief discussion on the Russell Page Garden at The Frick Collection. There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 9:30 PM.

**Anthony Cohn and David Helpern, Co-Chairs**