

Russell Squire
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan**

May 18, 2023

Honorable Sarah Carroll, Chair
NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission
Municipal Building
One Center Street, 9th Floor
New York, New York 10007

RE:1014 Fifth Ave (Metropolitan Museum Historic District) – *David Chipperfield Architects, KARO Architects* - A Beaux-Arts style townhouse designed by Welch, Smith & Provot and constructed in 1906-7, with renovation and extension by Trowbridge & Livingston in 1926. Application is for further design developments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness as well as responding to two LPC conditions that were attached to the C of A.

Dear Chair Carroll,

At the Full Board meeting of Community Board 8 Manhattan held on May 18, 2023, the board approved the following resolution by a vote of 31 in favor, 8 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

WHEREAS 1014 Fifth Avenue, now the home of the German Cultural Center, is a Beaux-Arts style town house designed by Welch, Smith & Provot and constructed in 1906-07. A renovation and extension by Trowbridge & Livingston 1926;

WHEREAS in June 2021 David Chipperfield Architects (after winning an international competition) together with New York-based KARO architects were commissioned by the Federal Government of Germany to convert the former headquarters of the Goethe Institute into a new center for transatlantic dialogue;

WHEREAS 1014 Fifth Avenue came before the Community Board #8 Landmarks Committee last July (2022);

WHEREAS the Landmarks Commission approved a Certificate of Appropriateness last September with two conditions attached: a narrower entrance canopy and a change to the window material at the ground floor to the left of the entrance;

WHEREAS the applicant is also proposing further design development: egress stair improvement, bench relocation, vitrine relocation to interior vestibule and previously approved limestone paving to become granite;

WHEREAS the proposed changes to the egress stair result in the relocation of the entrance vitrine and the bench;

WHEREAS the proposed egress stair presents as more practical and is now centered on the existing window to the left of the front entrance; the formerly proposed steel window will be replaced with a new wood window following an LPC condition;

WHEREAS the new basement opening resulting from the new egress stair utilizes an existing window lintel;

WHEREAS the proposed egress stair will have a limestone banister/balustrade;

WHEREAS the proposed egress stair will have a metal gate;

WHEREAS the proposed vitrine will be moved from the sidewalk to the interior vestibule; the bench will be moved to the right of the entrance;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes more hard-wearing 5'x5' granite paving instead of limestone to replace the sidewalk along the 25' frontage along 5th Avenue; the proposed granite paving will be lighter in color than the adjacent sidewalks;

WHEREAS the proposed limestone relocated bench and the proposed limestone balustrade for the egress stair will reference/reinterpret historic details from the original front elevation, including the rounded details on the proposed bench and the proposed balustrade;

WHEREAS the entrance gate is now full-height, changing from a domestic scale to a cultural scale; the design of the painted steel metal work at the front entrance and at the gate for the proposed egress stair will be sensitive in quality but presents as a more graphic and abstract representation with a more or less square grid; the applicant does not want to replicate the decorative metal work at the 2nd floor balcony;

WHEREAS the juxtaposition of a more contemporary metal design on the entry gate and the gate to the egress stair with the historic ironwork on the rest of the front elevation is intended to complement the existing diversity of the metal work at the front elevation;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes new signage — a bronze signage plaque that fits into the stone rustication that will signify the building's address; to be added at the same location to the left of the entrance as the previous signage plaque;

WHEREAS the garden space to the south of 1014 5th Avenue now projects out 14''; it is atypical that a garden space along 5th Avenue is so wide; the resulting sidewalk space in front of 1010 Fifth Avenue is pinched;

WHEREAS if the garden space were to be made narrower, the proposed bench would project beyond the garden space and would have to be shortened;

WHEREAS the proposed refinements at the front elevation are an improvement; there is now more sympathy to the existing building;

WHEREAS the design of the full height metal gate at the entrance and of the matching design at the gate to the egress stair is too harsh and presents as too contemporary and is not contextual with the rest of the decorative iron work on the front elevation;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is disapproved as presented.

Please advise us of any action taken on this matter.

Sincerely,

Russell Squire

Russell Squire
Chair

David Helpern and Jane Parshall

David Helpern and Jane Parshall
Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Honorable Eric Adams, Mayor of the City of New York
Honorable Mark Levine, Manhattan Borough President
Honorable Jerry Nadler, 12th Congressional District Representative

Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 28th Senatorial District
Honorable José M. Serrano, NYS Senator, 29th Senatorial District
Honorable Edward Gibbs, NYS Assembly Member 68th Assembly District
Honorable Alex Bores, NYS Assembly Member, 73rd Assembly District
Honorable Rebecca Seawright, NYS Assembly Member 76th Assembly District
Honorable Keith Powers, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District
Honorable Julie Menin, NYC Council Member, 5th Council District