



The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
www.cb8m.com
Charles S. Warren, Chair

Phone: (212) 758-4340
Fax: (212) 758-4616
CB8M@aol.com - E-Mail
Elizabeth McKee, District Manager

2nd Avenue Subway Update

The following are questions submitted at the March 18, 2004 Community Board 8 Second Avenue Subway Task Force meeting. The responses have been provided by the MTA.

86th Street station:

a. What were the evaluation criteria used for siting entrances and ancillary facilities at the 86th Street station?

We have adopted a number of general criteria for the siting of subway station entrances. These criteria take into account the planning, service level, and physical location of a station.

Criteria used for Siting Station Entrances

- Site entrances such that they correspond to the origins and destinations of the majority of riders and provide sufficient space for projected subway ridership
- Locate entrances on corners and/or major cross streets, where possible, for visibility and safety, and limit avenue and street crossings to the extent possible
- Meet modern subway codes and standards as they affect emergency egress and ventilation (e.g. NFPA 130)
- Minimize construction impacts and utility relocations
- Maintain or improve sidewalk pedestrian flows
- Community Board input
- Depth of the station
- Minimize the distance between subway access points (i.e. between stations)
- Minimize residential and business displacement (Preferred location for entrances in order of priority are: easements adopted for the subway under the city's zoning code, vacant lots, plazas, retail/commercial properties, residential properties or community resources)
- Create safe and convenient connections with other transit services
- Provide sufficient space for stairs, elevators and/or escalators

Specific Criteria Utilized for the 86th Street Station

We received much feedback from Community Board 8 regarding entrances at the 86th Street station. Three entrance locations have been selected for this station: the northeast and southeast corner of 86th Street and Second Avenue, and the southeast of 83rd Street and Second Avenue. At this specific station the entrance locations were selected based on the following:

- Site entrances such that they correspond to the origins and destinations of the majority of riders and provide sufficient space for projected subway ridership. Eighty percent (80) of the anticipated users of this station will be coming from/going to the east side of Second Avenue; thus entrances on the east side of Second Avenue were preferred.
- Locate entrances on corners and/or major cross streets, where possible, for visibility and safety, and limit avenue and street crossings to the extent possible. Corner entrances were selected for visibility and access, and to encourage safer street crossing. The 86th Street entrances are at the corner, and are on the side of the avenue from which the greatest number of riders will come, thereby limiting dangerous avenue crossings. The 83rd Street entrance is as close to the corner as possible. In addition, two of the three entrances were sited on the major crosstown street (86th Street).

- Meet modern subway codes and standards as they affect emergency egress and ventilation (e.g. NFPA 130). These station entrances have been designed to meet all modern subway codes, including access for disabled passengers.
- Minimize construction impacts and utility relocations. Entrances at this station were placed in either plazas or buildings to minimize utility disruptions. Based on preliminary field investigations, the locations selected would have the minimal impacts to utility relocations.
- Maintain or improve sidewalk pedestrian flows. Sidewalk stairs are least preferred for a number of reasons. A typical entrance will require three vertical circulation elements (VCEs, i.e. stairs or escalators) with a total width of approximately 26 feet. This is wider than a typical New York City sidewalk. A typical New York City sidewalk on Second Avenue is 20 feet wide and a side street sidewalk is 15 feet wide. Additionally, as a result of modern building codes, new entrances require weather protection enclosures that would create either a visual blockage in front of a commercial establishment or a roadside blockage for vehicular movements.
- Community Board input. Community Board 8 recommended public access at the intersections of Second Avenue and 86th and 83rd Streets.
- Depth of the station. The significant depth of the 86th Street station imposed restrictions on where entrances could be located. A relatively long path is required to climb from the mezzanine to the street level. If an entrance were located down a crosstown street, the necessary passageway to reach the depth of the station would impact at least four properties.
- Minimize the distance between subway access points. Where possible, the distance between adjacent stations was minimized by placing entrances at the ends of the mezzanines. Based on the current station entrance proposals, there are currently 11 blocks between entrances to the 72nd and 86th Street stations (entrances at 83rd and 72nd Streets), and 8 blocks between entrances to the 86th and 96th Street stations (entrances at 86th and 94th Streets). Moving the 83rd Street station entrance south, although having the beneficial effect of moving entrance points closer, would create a long underground passageway, creating safety and security risks for customers, as well as additional costs.
- Minimize residential and business displacement. As mentioned earlier, the preferred location for entrances in order of priority are:
 1. Easements adopted for the subway under the city's zoning code
 2. Vacant lots
 3. Plazas
 4. Retail/commercial properties
 5. Community resources (depending on use)
 6. Residential properties
- Create safe and convenient connections with other transit services. At 86th Street, there are bus stops for the eastbound and westbound crosstown M86 route, as well as the downtown M15 route.
- Provide sufficient space for stairs, elevators and/or escalators. Ridership demand at this station is projected to be extremely high. Based on the projected demand, and in order to meet building code requirements, stairs, escalators and/or elevators are proposed at both the 86th Street and 83rd Street entrances. Stairs, escalators and elevators ensure prompt exiting from the station, particularly, in the case of stairs and escalators, during an emergency. Elevators allow for an accessible route from the street to the mezzanine fare control area (an additional elevator will be provided from the mezzanine to the platform).

b. The owner of Tony DiNapoli 's restaurant, 1606 Second Avenue, requested that we look at the other three corners of 83rd Street and Second Avenue, particularly the plaza as an alternative to siting the entrance/ancillary in his ground floor commercial space.

A station entrance was proposed at this location based on the following:

- As discussed above, the majority of customers (80%) utilizing this station will travel to or from the east side of Second Avenue.
- The proposed entrance location does not require the acquisition of any residential property. Any other location in the area, including any mid-block locations, would require residential and commercial property acquisition.

- Due to the depth of the station and projected ridership, the entrance requires a long and narrow piece of real estate. Utilizing any other property in this general vicinity would require "double-backing" the VCEs (stairs/escalators). Double backing means one flight of a VCE, then a landing, and then another flight of a VCE in the opposite direction. Such a configuration would require a minimum of two property takings, including residential relocation.

Evaluation of Suggested Alternate Locations:

Northwest corner of 83rd Street and Second Avenue

- A sidewalk equipment access hatch to facilitate access to large pieces of station mechanical or electrical equipment will be located on this corner.
- The addition of an entrance at this location would require the acquisition of two buildings with 12 residential units and 5 commercial units.

Southwest corner of 83rd Street and Second Avenue

- Ancillary facilities requiring the acquisition of 6 residential units and 3 commercial properties will be located on this corner.
- The addition of an entrance at this location would require the acquisition of an additional 11 residential units and 4 commercial properties.

Northeast corner of 83rd Street and Second Avenue (Plaza area)

- An emergency egress stairway will be located beneath the plaza on this corner. Moving the entrance into this plaza, and out of 1606 Second Avenue, would not reduce the overall property impact because the emergency egress stair is still required.
- Extending the entrance to the plaza on the NE corner of 83rd Street would require construction of a long underground corridor, which would create safety and security concerns. Additionally, an entrance at this location would impact additional building columns and increase the project cost.

Southeast corner of 83rd Street and Second Avenue

- Moving the entrance to this location would require the acquisition of 20 residential and 2 commercial units.

c. Why can't the 85th Street plaza be used for a station entrance?

- Community Board 8 recommended public access at the intersections of Second Avenue and 86th Street and 83rd Street. The current proposals accommodate these requests.
- 86th Street is the principal business and crosstown street, as well as transportation corridor, at this station. Moving the entrance to 85th Street would make intermodal transfers between the subway and bus more difficult, and reduce its convenience and visibility for customers from the north.
- Two entrances at 86th Street are required in order to meet projected capacity requirements. Having only one entrance on 86th Street would not provide sufficient capacity, or would require that the remaining entrance would need to be much larger and therefore require additional property acquisition.
- Moving the 83rd Street entrance to 85th Street would increase customer walking distances for those traveling to or from the south of the station by approximately 300 feet, and would require crossing another crosstown street. Additionally, moving the southern entrance to 85th Street (north two blocks) would increase the distance between subway access points (at the 72nd and 86th Street stations).
- This would only be one block away from the 86th Street entrances and would not attract many customers.
- An entrance in the middle of the station would either require the construction of an additional fare control area or substantial alterations to the proposed layout, and therefore significantly increase the cost of the station.

72nd Street station:

Entrances at this station are proposed at the following intersections with Second Avenue:

1. NW corner 72nd Street

2. NE corner of 72nd Street
3. NE corner of 69th Street

a. Can you use the plaza on the SE corner of 74th Street?

- There is no plaza on the SE corner of 74th Street. However, there is a plaza area between 74th and 75th Streets. It commences approximately 45 feet north of the 74th Street property line and is approximately 30 feet wide for a distance of 90 feet. North of this, the plaza widens to approximately 80 feet wide. It is located in front of 300 East 75th Street, a large high-rise building. The MTA assumes this is the plaza referenced in the question.
- In order to accommodate projected ridership at this station, this entrance would require three escalators and be approximately 26 feet wide. This would severely restrict the sidewalk and access to the stores in the ground floor of the building.
- If the entrance were to be located at 75th Street, the entrance could be incorporated without severely restricting the side walk, but there would be significant property issues.
- An entrance at this location would be in excess of two blocks north of the proposed station platform. The effects of this would be:
 1. Either the construction of a long subsurface passageway, creating safety and security risks for customers, as well as additional costs, or moving the station 680 feet (over two blocks) to the north of its currently proposed location.
 2. Moving the station north would require the relocation of the other entrances and ancillary buildings at the station and would place the southern entrance north of 1st Street. This would extend the spacing between this station and the 55th Street station to 16 blocks, and reduce the distance to the 86th Street station to 8 blocks. Irregular station spacing would reduce operating speeds in the area and therefore make the line less competitive with the Lexington Avenue Line. This would reduce the overall attractiveness of the Second Avenue Line and therefore not provide necessary crowding relief on the Lexington Avenue Line. Additionally, moving the station north would likely require additional cut and cover construction, as the rock level is lower in this area. 72nd Street is required to be a three-track station to provide necessary operational flexibility and is therefore wider than typical stations. Cut and cover would require a substantial excavation across the full width of Second Avenue and would pose significant environmental, construction, operational and cost impacts.

b. Why aren't you putting a station entrance farther north?

See response above to Question (a) in the "72nd Street Station" section.

c. What are the costs of building the 72nd Street station?

Costs for specific elements of the project are still being refined.

d. What are the impacts of building the 72nd Street station?

The Final Environmental Impact Statement (FEIS) describes in detail the impacts associated with construction of the project, including the 72nd Street station as well as the other stations and tunnels. As described in the FEIS, construction activities would be disruptive, including noise, dust, and disruption to traffic along Second Avenue and the side streets. The FEIS describes measures the project will take to mitigate these impacts. Each station would require some areas of cut-and-cover construction to create entrances and exits into the station. Each station would also require acquisition of some private property to allow creation of station entrances and ventilation facilities. Construction activities for stations would affect a three- to five-block area and could last three to five years.

Note: The Final Environmental Impact Statement is available at www.mta.info. Click on "Capital Construction", then "Second Avenue Subway". The Community Board 8 office and nearby libraries have paper copies of the FEIS for public viewing.

e. Provide mock traffic analysis of entrance in 305 East 72nd Street.

The FEIS includes an analysis of the potential for impacts to pedestrian conditions at station entrances once the project is complete (See FEIS, Chapter 5F, "Pedestrians"). Eleven representative stations were chosen for analysis, including the 72nd Street station. The analysis at 72nd Street station showed that no significant adverse impacts would occur. The number of passengers expected to enter and exit the 72nd Street station entrance during the morning peak hour is over 6,900.

f. Vent plants - will they smell? Make noise? What are the decibel levels?

Noise from ventilation facilities is discussed in the FEIS (see pages 12-32 and 12-33).

Acoustic louvers or silencers would be employed to ensure that noise levels are consistent with ambient levels. As described in the FEIS, any above-ground equipment would be designed so that the noise level produced would not exceed 60 dBA when measured at the facade of the nearest residential property. The air from the ventilation structures would be tunnel and station air, and would therefore be similar to air emitted from subway vents in the existing system.

g. What are you doing to protect the brick facades of buildings? What are the seismic effects of construction and operation of the subway on the building?

During construction precautions will be taken, such as noise and vibration studies along with building surveys, to address such issues as the protection of buildings and their facades. Monitoring will also be carried out through the construction period to ensure that appropriate levels of noise and vibration are not exceeded. The subway will be designed such that operation of the subway does not result in levels of noise and vibration in adjacent buildings that exceed those set down in the EIS documents.

The FEIS includes an analysis of possible vibration from construction and operation of the project on nearby buildings. This chapter (Chapter 12, "Noise and Vibration") describes the measures to be taken to protect nearby buildings from damage during construction. Prior to construction, surveys will be conducted of the alignment to identify buildings that are susceptible to damage from vibration. For those buildings, maximum permissible vibration levels will be set to limit the potential for damage to occur. The analysis of vibration from operating subway trains in the Supplemental Draft Environmental Impact Statement (SDEIS) identified only limited locations where the potential for impact exists, and mitigation measures were identified. Since that time, more refined analyses based on the latest designs have indicated that no significant adverse vibration impacts from operating trains would occur (see page 12-45 of the FEIS).

h. For the entrance in 301 East 69th Street, is there any way that you can just use space facing Second Avenue?

This recommendation can be investigated further, although it may require some additional takings in the basement. Additional detail of the existing structure will be required to further this option.

i. Please outline the extent of the work to be done at 301 East 69th Street. Will this work include any adjustments to the lobby area?

The project's goal is to minimize the amount of space required at this location, and at all locations requiring property acquisition. As mentioned previously, we have been unable to obtain building drawings at this time to assist in our design (see answer to previous question (h)). We again request that the building provide us with a copy of the requested drawings.

j. Why is an entrance not located at 68th Street as CB8 requested? Why are you taking private property when you have open plazas (which you say you prefer) and when CB8 is on record as not wanting you to take private property for entrances?

- In our initial discussions of station entrances with Community Board 8 in January 2002, the board requested an entrance as far south as possible to the 72nd Street station so as to minimize the distance to the next station south at 55th Street. At the time, we explained that a station in the Upper 60s was not possible because of alignment constraints and the need to connect to the Broadway Line at 63rd Street. Subsequent to this meeting,

advanced design and engineering revealed that a station entrance at 69th Street was the farthest south an entrance could be placed that will be safe, secure, minimize construction impacts and costs, and serve ridership demand.

- Generally, our preference is to place entrances in plazas wherever possible so as to reduce impacts on commercial and/or residential properties. However, this is just one of many criteria used in siting station entrances in the appropriate locations (see the response to question (a) in the 86th Street Station section). In many cases, there are overriding reasons not to utilize a plaza.
 1. An entrance in the plaza at 68th Street would create a two block-long subsurface corridor to connect the entrance to the mezzanine at 70th Street. As mentioned previously, long subsurface passageways create safety and security risks to our customers. Additionally, such a corridor would be constructed using cut and cover techniques along Second Avenue, considerably increasing disruption to street and pedestrian traffic and to local businesses. Additional utility diversions would also be required, requiring additional construction.
- In addition to the plaza on 68th Street, at the Community Board 8 meeting in March, we reviewed the difficulties in siting entrances at the following locations suggested by residents of 301 East 69th Street:
 1. The other three corners of 69th Street
 2. The four corners of 68th Street
 3. The four corners of 70th Street

Each of the other alternate locations either had the same or worse impacts than an entrance in 301 East 69th Street or did not adequately meet the requirements of this station entrance.

Real Estate:

a. Has any consideration been given to commercial tenants?

In those cases where we seek to acquire a property, the MTA determines the amount of its offer to property owners based on independent property appraisals, and in the case of commercial tenants, trade fixture appraisals, performed by appraisers hired by the MTA. The appraisers determine compensation for real property generally on the basis of fair market value, and in the case of partial takings, diminution (if any) to the value of the remaining property. Compensation for trade fixtures owned by commercial tenants is determined on the basis of "sound value," which under New York law generally constitutes a fixture's reproduction cost less depreciation. The amount of MTA/NYC Transit's offer is based on the fair market value of the property as determined by an independent appraisal.

For the Second Avenue Subway project, offers in the full amount of MTA/NYC Transit's highest approved appraisal will be made as soon as practicable after the public hearing; in some cases, they might be made prior to the hearing. Residential apartments that are rented, rather than owned, typically have no market value to the tenant, although such tenants may be eligible for relocation benefits under the Federal Uniform Relocation Assistance and Real Property Acquisition Policies Act of 1970, as codified in Title 42, Section 4601 et seq. of the United States Code, and the applicable implementing regulations set forth in Title 49, Part 24 of the Code of Federal Regulations (collectively, the "Uniform Act").

b. There is no formula set in the federal guidelines for relocating residential tenants. They would like a response in writing as to what the formula will be.

For those properties that will be acquired for the Second Avenue Subway project, MTA and NYC Transit would adhere to the requirements of the New York State Eminent Domain Procedure Law (the "Eminent Domain Procedure Law") and the Uniform Act.

Prior to being required to vacate any business or residence, MTA and NYC Transit will provide owners and occupants with relocation assistance and benefits under the Uniform Act and at least 90 days advance notice of the need to vacate.

For the Second Avenue Subway project, offers in the full amount of MTA/NYC Transit's highest approved appraisal will be made as soon as practicable after the public hearing; in some cases, they might be made prior to

the hearing. Residential apartments that are rented, rather than owned, typically have no market value to the tenant, although such tenants may be eligible for relocation benefits under the Uniform Act. In those instances in which businesses and persons are displaced by the project, the Uniform Act authorizes reimbursement for reasonable moving costs and related expenses. Other benefits also may be available to displaced businesses and persons. No person can be required to move from his or her dwelling unless at least one comparable replacement dwelling has been made available to the person. Where possible, three or more replacement dwellings will be made available. The negotiated purchase price, or in the case of condemnation, the amount of MTA/NYC Transit's appraisal, will be made available to each affected owner/occupant or tenant before possession of the property is surrendered to MTA/NYC Transit.

The MTA urges anyone with questions regarding Second Avenue Subway project to call the MTA Hotline at 1-718-694-5164. Please be sure to leave a message as this number is checked throughout the day.